

AGENDA ITEM 7c



STAFF REPORT

TYPE MEETING:	Regular Board	MEETING DATE:	May 6, 2015
SUBMITTED BY:	Dan Martin Engineering Manager	PROJECT:	VARIOUS DIV. NO. ALL
APPROVED BY:	<input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Rod Posada, Chief, Engineering <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> German Alvarez, Assistant General Manager <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> Mark Watton, General Manager		
SUBJECT:	Award of As-Needed Construction Management and Inspection Services Contract in an amount not-to-exceed \$350,000 for Fiscal Years 2016 and 2017		

GENERAL MANAGER'S RECOMMENDATION:

That the Otay Water District (District) Board of Directors (Board) award a professional As-Needed Construction Management and Inspection Services (CMIS) contract to Alyson Consulting (Alyson) and to authorize the General Manager to execute an agreement with Alyson in an amount not-to-exceed \$350,000 for a period of two (2) fiscal years, FY 2016 and FY 2017 (ending June 30, 2017).

COMMITTEE ACTION:

Please see Attachment A.

PURPOSE:

To obtain Board authorization for the General Manager to enter into a professional As-Needed CMIS agreement with Alyson in an amount not-to-exceed \$350,000 for two (2) fiscal years, FY 2016 and FY 2017 (ending June 30, 2017).

ANALYSIS:

The District will require the services of a professional CMIS consultant in support of the District's Capital Improvement Program (CIP) projects for two (2) fiscal years, FY 2016 and FY 2017 (ending June 30, 2017).

The District has used an as-needed contract for construction management and inspection over the last two fiscal years. The annual effort of the As-Needed CMIS, used to support the District's CIP from January 2013 through January 2015, averaged hours that equated to less than a full-time employee (FTE) at a rate of 0.4 FTE per year. Use of the As-Needed CMIS will provide the District with the ability to obtain consulting services in a timely and efficient manner. An analysis of the CIP workload for FY 2016 and FY 2017 indicates a similar level of effort will be needed for construction management services.

The District will issue task orders to the consultant for specific projects during the contract period based on a detailed scope of work. The consultant will then prepare a schedule, and fee estimate for each task order assigned under the contract. Upon written task order authorization from the District, the consultant shall then proceed with the project as described in the scope of work.

The anticipated CIP projects that are estimated to require construction management and partial inspection for the duration of this contract are listed below:

CIP	Capital Facilities Project	ESTIMATED COST
P2267	36-Inch Main Pump Outs and Air/Vacuum Ventilation Installations	\$10,000
P2529	711-2 Reservoir Interior/Exterior Coating	\$25,000
P2530	711-1 Reservoir Interior/Exterior Coating	\$30,000
P2537	Operations Yard Property Improvements	\$20,000
P2541	624 Pressure Zone Pressure Reducing Stations	\$15,000
R2110	944-1 Optimization and Pressure Zone Modifications	\$10,000
S2033	Sewer System Rehabilitation Rancho San Diego Phase I	\$75,000
S2024	Campo Road Sewer Replacement	\$145,000
TOTAL:		\$330,000

The CMIS scopes of work for the above projects are estimated from preliminary information and past projects. Therefore, staff

believes that a \$350,000 cap on the As-Needed CMIS contract is adequate, while still providing additional capacity for unforeseen support needs by the District.

This As-Needed CMIS contract does not commit the District to any expenditure until a task order is approved to perform work on a CIP project. The District does not guarantee work to the consultant, nor does the District guarantee that it will expend all of the funds authorized by the contract on professional services.

The District solicited for Construction Management and Inspection Services by placing an advertisement on the Otay Water District's website on January 27, 2015 with various other publications including the San Diego Daily Transcript. Nine (9) firms submitted a Letter of Interest and a Statement of Qualifications. The Request for Proposal (RFP) for As-Needed CMIS was sent to the nine (9) firms resulting in four (4) proposals received by February 27, 2015.

- Alyson Consulting, San Diego, CA
- Dudek & Associates, Inc., Encinitas, CA
- Hill International, Inc., Ontario, CA
- Bureau Veritas North America, Inc., Sacramento, CA

The five (5) firms located in San Diego that chose not to propose are CALTROP Corporation, Hoch Consulting, Kal Krishnan Consulting Services, Inc., Nuera Project Consulting, LLC, and Vali Cooper & Associates, Inc.

In accordance with the District's Policy 21, staff evaluated and scored all written proposals and interviewed the top three (3) firms on March 26, 2015. Alyson received the highest score for their services based on their experience, understanding of the scopes of work, proposed method to accomplish the work, and their composite hourly rate. Alyson was the most qualified consultant with the best overall rating or ranking score. A summary of the complete evaluation is shown in Attachment B.

Alyson submitted the Company Background Questionnaire as required by the RFP and staff did not find any outstanding issues. In addition, staff checked their references and performed an internet search on the company. Staff found the references to be excellent and did not find any outstanding issues with the internet search. Alyson is providing these services to the District under the District's current CMIS contract. Staff found that Alyson's performance under the current contract has been exceptional.

FISCAL IMPACT: Joe Beachem, Chief Financial Officer

The funds for this contract will be expended for a variety of projects, as previously noted above. This contract is for as-needed professional services based on the District's need and schedule, and expenditures will not be made until a task order is approved by the District for the consultant's services on a specific CIP project.

Based on a review of the financial budgets, the Project Manager anticipates that the budgets will be sufficient to support the professional as-needed consulting services required for the CIP projects noted above.

The Finance Department has determined that the funds to cover this contract will be available as budgeted for these projects.

STRATEGIC GOAL:

This Project supports the District's Mission statement, "To provide high value water and wastewater services to the customers of the Otay Water District in a professional, effective, and efficient manner" and the District's Vision, "A District that is innovative in providing water services at affordable rates, with a reputation for outstanding customer service."

LEGAL IMPACT:

None.

General Manager

P:\WORKING\As Needed Services\Construction Management\As Needed CM & Inspection Svcs FY16, FY17\Staff Report\BD 5-6-15_As-Needed CMIS FY16 - FY17_Staff Report\Staff Report, As-Needed Engineering Construction Management and Inspection Services 3-30-15.docx

DM:mlc

Attachments: Attachment A - Committee Action
Attachment B - Summary of Proposal Rankings



ATTACHMENT A

SUBJECT/PROJECT:	Award of As-Needed Construction Management and Inspection Services Contract in an amount not-to-exceed \$350,000 for Fiscal Years 2016 and 2017
VARIOUS	

COMMITTEE ACTION:

The Engineering, Operations, and Water Resources Committee reviewed this item at a meeting held on April 21, 2015, and the following comments were made:

- Staff recommended that the Board award a professional As-Needed Construction Management and Inspection Services (CMIS) contract to Alyson Consulting (Alyson) and to authorize the General Manager to execute an agreement with Alyson in an amount not-to-exceed \$350,000 for a period of two (2) fiscal years, FY 2016 and FY 2017 (ending June 30, 2017).
- It was discussed that staff analyzed the level of effort needed for construction management services over the last two fiscal years which equated to less than a full-time employee at a rate of 0.4. Staff anticipates a similar level of effort for construction management for FYs 2016 and 2017.
- Staff stated that the District will require the services of an as-needed construction management and inspection services consultant to support the District's Capital Improvement Program (CIP) for FYs 2016 and 2017.
- The CIP projects that are supported by construction management include reservoir coating projects, sewer replacement and rehabilitation projects, and potable and recycled water system improvement projects. Please refer to Page 2 of the staff report for detailed information about these projects.
- Staff stated that their selection process was in accordance to the District's Policy 21. Nine (9) firms submitted a letter of interest and four (4) firms submitted a proposal. It was noted that five (5) staff members reviewed the proposal and also participated in interviews for three firms that were

shortlisted. The results of the analysis are shown in Attachment B of the staff report.

- It was indicated that Alyson Consulting of San Diego received the highest score. Staff checked Alyson's references, reviewed their Company Background Questionnaire form, and performed an internet search on the company and did not find any significant issues. Staff noted that Alyson is registering with the Department of Industrial Relations which is a new requirement of Senate Bill 854.
- Staff stated that Alyson is relatively a new company; however, the individuals proposed on this project have worked with the District on past projects with previous firms and they are currently providing As-Needed Construction Management and Inspection services. It was highlighted that Alyson's performance has been exceptional.
- The Committee commented that Alyson Consulting's score of 138 was significantly higher than the other candidate's score. Staff stated that during the interview process, Alyson came prepared with Alyson's Construction Manager (CM) and Inspection staff that would be directly assigned to the contract. Alyson's CM responded directly to the Selection Panel's questions. Staff noted that it was nice to personally meet the construction management team who would work directly with District staff on projects; this feedback was provided to the other candidates for future reference. In addition, staff was impressed with Alyson's thought process about environmental and community issues. It was noted that Alyson's proposed fees were also the lowest.
- The Committee commented that the District's selection process is the most transparent process that they have ever seen as candidates are provided detailed information about request for proposals as well as feedback after the selection process has been completed.
- In response to a question by the Committee, staff stated that the District's estimate of services required in support of construction is pretty accurate. In addition, it was noted that District staff closely monitors consultants' expenditures to ensure value and avoid their exceeding contract amount.

Following the discussion, the Committee supported staffs' recommendation and presentation to the full board as a consent item.

**ATTACHMENT B
SUMMARY OF PROPOSAL RANKINGS
As-Needed Construction Management and Inspection Services**

MAXIMUM POINTS	WRITTEN						ORAL						TOTAL SCORE	REFERENCES			
	Qualifications of Staff	Understanding of Scope, Schedule and Resources	Soundness and Viability of Proposed Project Plan	INDIVIDUAL SUBTOTAL - WRITTEN	AVERAGE SUBTOTAL - WRITTEN	Proposed Rates*	Consultant's Commitment to DBE	AVERAGE TOTAL WRITTEN	Additional Creativity and Insight	Strength of Project Manager	Presentation, Communication Skills	Quality of Response to Questions			INDIVIDUAL TOTAL - ORAL	AVERAGE TOTAL ORAL	
Bureau Veritas	Adolfo Segura	24	20	24	68	85	15	Y/N	100	15	15	10	10	50	50	150	Poor/Good/Excellent
	Armando Buelna	24	22	23	69												
	Steve Begpler	21	19	23	63	67	3	Y	70								
	Brandon DiPietro	25	21	24	70												
	Kevin Cameron	24	20	23	67												
Hill International	Adolfo Segura	23	21	22	66											110	
	Armando Buelna	23	22	25	70												
	Steve Begpler	25	22	26	72	70	1	N	71								
	Brandon DiPietro	26	20	24	70												
	Kevin Cameron	25	22	24	71												
Alyson Consulting	Adolfo Segura	28	24	28	80											138	Excellent
	Armando Buelna	28	24	25	77												
	Steve Begpler	28	24	26	78	78	15	Y	93								
	Brandon DiPietro	28	24	27	78												
	Kevin Cameron	28	24	28	78												
Dudek	Adolfo Segura	26	23	26	75											114	
	Armando Buelna	26	23	26	75												
	Steve Begpler	27	23	26	75	75	3	Y	78								
	Brandon DiPietro	27	21	25	73												
	Kevin Cameron	27	23	27	77												

*The fees were evaluated by comparing rates for six positions. The sum of these six rates are noted on the table to the left. Note: The Review Panel does not see or consider rates when scoring other categories. Rates are scored by the PM, who is not on the Review Panel.

Consultant	Rate	Position	Score
Bureau Veritas	\$820	highest	3
Hill International	\$855	highest	1
Alyson Consulting	\$645	lowest	15
Dudek	\$825	lowest	3